Potential of thermally integrated high-temperature electrolysis and methanation for the storage of energy by Power-to-Gas

Stephan Anger
TU Bergakademie Freiberg, Institute of Thermal Engineering, Freiberg, Germany

Dimosthenis Trimis
Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, Engler-Bunte-Institute Division of Combustion Technology, Karlsruhe, Germany

Keywords: Synthetic Natural Gas, Power-to-Gas, High-temperature Electrolysis, Methanation
Abstract

Natural gas is one of the most important primary energy sources with a well developed infrastructure, especially in Europe, and among fossil fuels, natural gas has the lowest CO₂ emissions. It is used in almost all thermal applications in the industry and in domestic, commercial as well as mobile applications.

In addition to the fossil primary energy sources, the share of renewable energies in primary energy consumption is steadily increasing. Amongst others, the share of renewable energy in gross final consumption was 13.0% in 2011 compared with 7.9% in 2004 for the EU27 [1]. However, besides all advantages, this results in a problem caused by the strongly fluctuating electricity supply during the generation by wind power and photovoltaics. An exemplary scenario: If the power supply exceeds significantly the demand, wind power stations have to be switched off and the potential of the systems is not completely utilized. Storage and energy transport technologies are needed providing necessary storage capacity, storage time and transport capacity. Indeed, chemical storages are the only possibility to provide capacities for the case of long-term or seasonal storage.

Especially in Europe, such energy storage is the well developed natural gas infrastructure. The Power-to-Gas-Technology (PtG) is a promising way to transfer electrical excess energy into chemical bond energy like hydrogen or Synthetic Natural Gas (SNG), which can be fed directly into the natural gas grid providing that the gas quality is in compliance with the limit values.

The generation of SNG is realized by coupling electrolysis and methanation. The high-temperature electrolysis offers advantages based on its thermodynamic characteristics compared to conventional electrolysis working at low temperatures. In this way a significant increasing efficiency can be achieved for the reconversion of SNG into heat and electrical power. An example: The efficiency of reconversion SNG generated by PtG with low-temperature electrolysis by Combined Heat and Power (CHP, \( \eta \approx 85\% \)) is 47%. In case of using PtG with high-temperature electrolysis the efficiency of reconversion increases up to 68%.

High-temperature electrolysis is based on the Solid Oxide Electrolysis Cell (SOEC) technology, which is still at a rather early development state, but shows, due to its thermodynamic characteristics at high temperatures major advantages.

Different variations of coupling HT-electrolysis (700-1000°C) and methanation (200-400°C) are conceivable due to their temperature levels. Amongst others, the heat of reaction of the exothermic methanation can be completely used for the evaporation of the process water for the electrolysis. Co-electrolysis of water and carbon dioxide and recirculation of process flows are further opportunities.

Different possible process schemes for coupling high-temperature electrolysis and methanation are shown in the presentation and are compared with the low-temperature electrolysis case.
1 Power-to-Gas

The increasing amount of electrical energy by renewable energies has a crowding-out effect on conventional power energy. However, a main critical aspect is given by the fluctuating characteristic of the renewables. If supply exceeds power demand, operators of wind power stations will be forced to shut down and the full capacity of the plant is not met. One solution of this suboptimal behavior is a storage- and transport technology that is able to provide required storage capacity as well as storage time and transport capacity. Hereby, conversion into chemical bond energy is the primary solution to meet required capacities in cases of long time and seasonal storage. An interesting way is the technology of Power-to-Gas (PtG), illustrated schematically in figure 1.

![Figure 1: Schematic diagram Power-to-Gas including reconversion into electrical power](image)

Base is the presence of a well-developed natural gas infrastructure that is able to provide required capacities. Intention of Power-to-Gas is the transfer of electrical excess energy into chemical bond energy by electrolysis in the form of hydrogen. Hydrogen can be fed directly into the gas infrastructure in compliance with the limits of gas quality, furthermore, converted into methane by methanation. Among others, the total efficiency of the Power-to-Gas concept must be considered to evaluate the economy, including reconversion into electrical power and/or heat. A total efficiency of 30%, respectively 47% can be expected for combination of conventional low-temperature electrolysis with methanation including reconversion by Combined Cycle Power Plant (CCPP) or Combined Heat and Power (CHP). Higher efficiencies are met by using high-temperature electrolysis due to thermodynamic advantages.

2 High-temperature electrolysis and methanation

2.1. High-temperature electrolysis

The standard reaction enthalpy for water decomposition by electrolysis

\[ \text{H}_2\text{O}_{(l)} \rightarrow \text{H}_2_{(g)} + \frac{1}{2}\text{O}_2_{(g)} \quad \Delta_r H^0 = 286 \text{ kJ/mol} \]  

is supplied by electrical work. The equivalent potential difference corresponds to 1.48 V (standard conditions), according to
\[ E^0_H = -\frac{\Delta_r H^0}{z \cdot F}, \]  

(2)

whereby \( \Delta_r H^0 \) is defined by

\[ \Delta_r H^0 = \Delta_r G^0 + T \cdot \Delta_r S^0. \]  

(3)

Only \( \Delta_r G \) has to be added theoretically by electrical work. A Voltage of 1.23 V (standard conditions) is required, according to

\[ E^0_G = -\frac{\Delta_r G^0}{z \cdot F}. \]  

(4)

The difference in form of \( T \Delta_r S^0 \) can be added by thermal energy. Liquid water is used for conventional low-temperature electrolysis (<100°C), hence enthalpy of vaporization must be delivered additionally, 0.23 V according to

\[ U_v = \frac{\Delta H_v}{z \cdot F}. \]  

(5)

\( \Delta_r H \) und \( \Delta_r G \) are functions of temperature, which also applies to the equivalent voltages (see figure 2).

![Figure 2: Reaction enthalpy \( \Delta_r H \) & Gibbs enthalpy \( \Delta_r G \) and equivalent voltage as function of temperature](image)

The required minimum voltage can be reduced by the amount of voltage that corresponds to vaporization enthalpy in case of steam electrolysis. Furthermore, figure 2 shows clearly a decrease of \( \Delta G \) with higher temperatures in contrast to \( \Delta H \). The higher the temperature the less is the required minimum voltage and thus the content of electrical work despite of necessary overvoltage for covering polarization resistance and ohmic losses. In this way, the high-temperature electrolysis contains energetic potential, especially in availability of waste heat from other processes. Three different operating modes exist, according to operating voltage:

- **Endothermic operation:** \( U_B < E_H \)

  The operating voltage \( U_B \) is less than the thermo-neutral potential difference \( E_H \). Difference \((E_{fr} - U_B)\) is supplied as thermal energy.
• Autothermal operation: \( U_B = E_H \)

Operating voltage corresponds to the thermo-neutral potential difference. No thermal energy is delivered or required.

• Exothermic operation: \( U_B > E_H \)

The operating voltage \( U_B \) is higher than the thermo-neutral potential difference \( E_H \). Difference \( (U_B - E_H) \) is delivered as thermal energy.

CO\(_2\) can be also converted by high-temperature electrolysis in addition to H\(_2\)O, an interesting aspect in terms of measures for decreasing emissions of this greenhouse gas.

\[
\text{CO}_2 \rightarrow \text{CO} + \frac{1}{2} \text{O}_2 \quad \Delta_r H^0 = 283 \text{ kJ} / \text{mol} \tag{6}\]

Furthermore, technical advantages are met. The product gas consists of H\(_2\) and CO, typical components for syngas applications.

2.2 State of research in the field of high-temperature electrolysis

Alkaline electrolysis (AEC) on large scale and Proton-Exchange-Membrane electrolysis (PEMEC) on smaller scale are established than state of the art for low-temperature applications. R&D of high-temperature electrolysis is still in its infancy. One promising technology is the SOEC (Solid Oxide Electrolysis Cell). Activities in this field were started in the middle of the 1970s in Germany within the project HOT ELLY (High Operating Temperature Electrolysis) [2, 3]. However, intensive development efforts with the aim of maturity phase were not continued. Renewed activities were done in course of establishing high-temperature fuel cells based on solid oxide materials (SOFC) in the middle of the last decade. One reason is the reversibility of the process; cells based on SOFC can be used as SOEC after modifications of cell materials. Following reactions occur in the SOEC (figure 3):

\[
\text{Cathode reaction} \quad 2\text{H}_2\text{O} + 4e^- \rightarrow 2\text{H}_2 + 2\text{O}^{2-} \quad 2\text{CO}_2 + 4e^- \rightarrow 2\text{CO} + 2\text{O}^{2-} \tag{7}\]
Anode reaction

\[ 2O^{2-} \rightarrow O_2 + 4e^- \]  \hspace{1cm} (8)

Global reaction

\[ 2H_2O \rightarrow 2H_2 + O_2 \]  \hspace{1cm} (9)

SOFC and SOEC consist of anode, cathode and electrolyte. Both are characterized by high electrode kinetics due to high operating temperatures, therefore no noble metal catalysts are needed. Yttrium-doped zirconia (YSZ) is the base material of the electrolyte, characterized by very good thermal stability and high ionic conductivity. In contrast to SOFC, SOEC exists only on laboratory scale. Development work will be carried out around the world, for example at the company sunfire in Germany [4], at Topsoe Fuel Cell and Risø National Laboratory for Sustainable Energy, Technical University of Denmark – DTU [5, 6], at Idaho National Laboratory, USA [7] and at the Central Research Institute of Electric Power Industry, Japan [8] to name only a few.

2.3 Methanation

Methanation describes the catalytic conversion of \( \text{H}_2 \) with \( \text{CO} \) or \( \text{CO}_2 \) into methane (SNG Synthetic Natural Gas) and water:

\[ \text{CO} + 3\text{H}_2 \leftrightarrow \text{CH}_4 + \text{H}_2\text{O} \hspace{1cm} \Delta_r H^0 = -206 \text{kJ/ mol} \]  \hspace{1cm} (10)

\[ \text{CO}_2 + 4\text{H}_2 \leftrightarrow \text{CH}_4 + 2\text{H}_2\text{O} \hspace{1cm} \Delta_r H^0 = -165 \text{kJ/ mol} \]  \hspace{1cm} (11)

Typical SNG-reactor concepts are fixed or fluidized bed reactors. Alternatively, there are investigations on using bubble column reactors, which offer advantages in the removal of reaction heat and temperature control [9]. Catalysts for methanation of CO and/or \( \text{CO}_2 \) are available on market; usually the methanation catalyst can be used for both. Results of own measurement data and published experimental [10, 11] data show higher conversion rates in case of CO-methanation (80-100%, 200°C) compared to \( \text{CO}_2 \) (40-90%, 250°C), particularly at lower temperatures. One reason is the thermodynamic stability of \( \text{CO}_2 \) compared to CO. Furthermore, \( \text{CO}_2 \)-methanation can be described as combined reaction of water-gas-shift reaction and CO-methanation whereby the whole reaction proceeds more slowly. The reactions are mol-reducing and therefore favored by high pressures.

3. Procedural interconnections and potential of high-temperature electrolysis and methanation

3.1 Bases of calculation in \textit{ASPEN PLUS®}

The fundamental aspect of interconnections that are shown in the following is given by the characteristic of different heat flows of the system. The summarized heat quantity generated by overvoltage (exothermic operation), cooling and the reaction heat of methanation is larger than the required heat quantity for vaporization and preheating of the reactant water in case of the following boundary conditions:
All determinations were carried out in *ASPEN PLUS®* using Gibbs-reactors and heat exchanger. A user model was implemented to calculate the electrolysis. Following parameters were set for simulation:

- Electrolysis conversion 80%
- Operation temperature high-temperature electrolysis 800°C
- Operation temperature low-temperature electrolysis 70°C
- Operation mode of high-temperature electrolysis is exothermic \( U_B = 1.4 \text{ V} \); corresponds to an overvoltage of 0.11 V related to \( E_{H_2, 800\degree C} \)
- Operation mode of low-temperature electrolysis is exothermic \( U_B = 1.85 \text{ V} \); corresponds to an overvoltage of 0.38 V related to \( E_{H_2, 70\degree C} \)
- Methanation 25 bar, 250°C

Waste heat from electrolysis was calculated according to

\[
\dot{Q}_{\text{Elyse}} = H_{H_2O,\text{in}} + P_{\text{el}} - \left( H_{H_2O,\text{out}} + H_{H_2} + H_{O_2} \right) \tag{12}
\]

- \( H_{H_2O,\text{in}} \) Supplied enthalpy flow of water
- \( H_{H_2O,\text{out}} \) Enthalpy flow of not converted water (20%)
- \( H_{H_2}, H_{O_2} \) Enthalpy flow of products
- \( P_{\text{el}} \) Electrical power of electrolysis

with operating voltage \( U_B \) and current \( I_B \)

\[
P_{\text{el}} = U_B \cdot I_B \tag{13}
\]

whereby \( I_B \) is based on 2nd Faradays Law and on converted water

\[
I_B = n_{H_2O,u} \cdot z \cdot F . \tag{14}
\]

A Gibbs-reactor was implemented for methanation. The calculated composition corresponds to the thermodynamic equilibrium that is based on given temperature and pressure.

Determination of efficiency was calculated on molar gross calorific value of methane (887 kJ/mol), according to:

\[
\eta = \frac{n_{\text{CH}_4} \cdot H^0_{\text{CH}_4}}{P_{\text{el}} + \dot{Q}_{\text{VW,H}_2O} + \dot{Q}_{\text{VW,CO}_2}} \tag{15}
\]
• $n_{CH4}$  Methane product mole flow

• $Q_{VW,i}$  External heat flow for preheating educts to reaction temperature in case of reduced delivery of internal heat sources (H$_2$O $\rightarrow$ 800°C electrolysis, CO$_2$ $\rightarrow$ 250°C methanation)

Process simulations were done stationary without consideration of heat losses.

3.3 Procedural Interconnections

3.3.1 Low-temperature electrolysis including CO$_2$-methanation

Liquid water is fed into the exothermic operating electrolysis in low-temperature region; the enthalpy of vaporization must be applied additionally in the form of electric energy.

![Diagram of low-temperature electrolysis coupled with CO$_2$-methanation](image)

**Figure 4: Low-temperature electrolysis coupled with CO$_2$-methanation**

Figure 4 demonstrates the interconnection schematically with the example of alkaline electrolysis. Reaction heat of methanation was used as heat source and cold educt streams of electrolysis (H$_2$, CO$_2$) as heat sink respectively. The electrolysis waste heat at low temperature level is not included. The total efficiency of the system is 61%. If H$_2$ is considered as the target product without methanation a total efficiency of 80% is achieved.

3.3.2 High-temperature electrolysis including methanation

The combination of high-temperature electrolysis and CO$_2$-methanation offers opportunities in heat recirculation due to additional heat sources and sinks. This refers to methanation reaction heat as well as cooling of product stream after methanation in addition to the electrolysis and product streams waste heat (figure 5). Exothermic methanation reaction heat is integrated completely into the vaporization of process water. A total efficiency of 81% was determined for this kind of interconnection in exothermic operation of electrolysis.
3.3.3 High-temperature co-electrolysis including CO-methanation

High-temperature electrolysis offers the opportunity to convert CO\textsubscript{2} electrochemically into CO and O\textsubscript{2} in addition to the conversion of steam at a high temperature level. Steam and CO\textsubscript{2} are preheated together to the temperature level of electrolysis (figure 6). H\textsubscript{2}O/CO\textsubscript{2}-ratio of 3.0 describes the stoichiometry of the following CO-methanation. A total efficiency of 82% was determined for this kind of interconnection in exothermic operation of electrolysis. Noticeable in this interconnection is a higher heat output in methanation. The electrolysis product gas contains CO primarily in addition to H\textsubscript{2}; it follows a higher heat extraction due to higher methanation reaction enthalpy of CO compared to CO\textsubscript{2}-methanation (according to equations 10, 11).
3.3.4 High-temperature electrolysis including methanation and recirculation

According to equation (11) water is the primary product component of CO₂-methanation in addition to CH₄ (CH₄/H₂O=1/2). The condensing of water content leads to loss of vaporization enthalpy. A fraction of methanation product stream is recirculated into the high-temperature electrolysis. Steam demand of the whole system including required preheating heat demand is minimized by this measure (figure 7). Fundamental requirement is no catalytic activity in terms of chemical reactions like water-gas-shift and steam reforming in addition to the electrochemical conversion. A total efficiency of 81% was determined for this kind of interconnection in exothermic operation of electrolysis.

3.3.5 High-temperature electrolysis including CO₂-methanation in cascades

Steam that is generated in methanation is used in a following process step in analogy to interconnection including recirculation. In contrast to recirculation this is realized by coupling of a further high-temperature electrolysis-methanation-module (figure 8). No other chemical reactions take place within electrolysis like in the variant of recirculation. In principle, several modules can be coupled. However,
amount of steam decreases from step to step and following modules are smaller in performance. Furthermore, increase of CH₄-content is limited by thermodynamic equilibrium. A total efficiency of 88% was determined for this kind of interconnection. The high efficiency is explained as following: Reaction heat of exothermic operating methanation cannot cover completely required vaporization enthalpy of process water. However, in case of coupling the first set up of electrolysis and methanation with methanation of second module required vaporization enthalpy is covered. Furthermore, steam can be preheated up to 240°C. Total efficiency decreases if a third module is coupled because no suitable heat sink exists for reaction heat of the third methanation step.

3.3.6 Discussion

The calculations have shown that high efficiencies are achieved by coupling high-temperature electrolysis and methanation. Independent of interconnection the maximum efficiency is given in endothermic operation of electrolysis. In this operational mode the difference between operating voltage and thermo-neutral voltage is covered by external heat supply resulting in a constant efficiency for endothermic operation independent of amount of voltage (valid for $U_B \leq x \leq U_H$). Furthermore, as long as resulting waste heat can be integrated into preheating of educt streams efficiency is not decreased with exceeding the thermo-neutral voltage into exothermic operation. Efficiency begins to decrease if this demand is covered because no suitable heat sink exists. Interconnection containing cascades is characterized by highest total efficiency. However, determinations must be carried out in terms of technical feasibility due to unwanted side reactions like water-gas-shift and steam reforming at cathode side of electrolysis. Furthermore, real efficiency is decreased by heat losses.

4. Summary

![Figure 9: Summary, total efficiency of investigated interconnections](image)

The system efficiencies of investigated interconnections are summarized in figure 9. The potential of increase in efficiency (>20%-points) by coupling high-temperature electrolysis with methanation compared to the low-temperature electrolysis-system can be seen clearly. Figure 10 illustrates individual efficiencies in the process chains of both variants including reconversion into electrical power and/or heat. For example, the total efficiency of process chain related to Combined Heat and Power...
(CHP) can be increased from 47.3% to 68.4% by using interconnection variant of high-temperature electrolysis in cascades. Development in field of high-temperature electrolysis based on SOEC is at an early stage. However, there are international efforts to raise the technology from laboratory scale to higher level. Potential shows that by reaching technical maturity an efficient method is given to store volatile renewable energies.

Figure 10: Comparison low- and high-temperature interconnections coupled with methanation, individual efficiencies and total efficiency including reconversion into electrical and/or thermal energy

**Formula symbols**

- \( E_0^H \)  Thermo-neutral potential difference
- \( E_0^G \)  Equivalent potential difference related to free standard reaction enthalpy
- \( F \)  Faraday’s constant (96485 C/mol)
- \( \Delta R G^0 \)  Free standard reaction enthalpy (298 K, 1 atm)
- \( \Delta R H^0 \)  Standard reaction enthalpy (298 K, 1 atm)
- \( H_{o,gr}^0 \)  Molar gross caloric value methane (887 kJ/mol)
- \( \Delta H_V \)  Vaporization enthalpy
- \( I_B \)  Operating current
- \( n_{H_2O,e} \)  Mole flow converted water (electrolysis)
- \( n_{CH_4} \)  Mole flow methane
- \( P_d \)  Electrical power
- \( \Delta R S^0 \)  Standard reaction entropy (298 K, 1 atm)
- \( U_B \)  Operating voltage
- \( z \)  Valence = 2 (electrolysis reaction H\(_2\)O, CO\(_2\))
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AEC</td>
<td>Alkali Electrolysis Cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CB</td>
<td>Condensing Boiler</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCPP</td>
<td>Combined Cycle Power Plant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOT ELLY</td>
<td>High Operating Temperature Electrolysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HT</td>
<td>High-temperature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHP</td>
<td>Combined Heat and Power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LT</td>
<td>Low-temperature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PtG</td>
<td>Power-to-Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEMEC</td>
<td>Proton-Exchange-Membrane Electrolysis Cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PV</td>
<td>Photovoltaic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SNG</td>
<td>Synthetic Natural Gas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOEC</td>
<td>Solid Oxide Electrolysis Cell</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOFC</td>
<td>Solid Oxide Fuel Cell</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Literature sources


